Charter Commission Meeting
October 3, 2022, 6:00 p.m.
Minutes

Attendance

Commissioners					
Name	Present	Absent	Name	Present	Absent
Amira Streeter	X		Debbie Kitchin	X	
Andrew Speer	X		Debra Porta	X	
Anthony Castaneda	X		Gloria Cruz	X	
Becca Uherbelau		X	Hanna Osman		X
Brenda Ketah		X	Raahi Reddy	X	
Bryan Williams Lewis	X		Salome Chimuku	X	
Candace Avalos	X		Yasmin Ibarra	X	
Dave Galat	X		Vacant		
David Chen	X		Vacant		
David Knowles	X		Vacant		

Staff and Guests Present			
Diana Nunez	Brandy Steffen (JLA)	Julia Meier	Sofia Alvarez-Castro
Shoshanah Oppenheim	Maja Haium	Diana Shiplet	Michael Jordan
Jessica Kinard			

Welcome

Brandy welcomed the group and provided meeting logistics. The interpreters provided information on how to access interpretation.

Co-chair Porta welcomed the group and provided an overview of the meeting agenda, upcoming timeline, and public comments recently submitted.

Commission Business

Approval of minutes of the August 30 full commission meeting. 12 commissioners approved. Minutes approved.

Approval of minutes of the August 16 voting rights subcommittee meeting. 4 sub-committee members approved. Minutes approved.

Verbal Public Comments

Ben Stevenson – thanked the commission for their work. Stated he is an organizer with Sunrise Movement and that fossil fuels are the root cause of climate and environmental justice issues facing the city. Earlier today they, along with 12 partner groups, submitted a letter to the commission advocating for inclusion of a fossil fuels phase out in the charter. He outlined the points of the letter including: 1) why must we phase out fossil fuels – Portland must phase out the use of fossil fuels to combat the worst of the climate crisis, 2) what would this look like in

the charter – they provided sample language, and 3) how can they partner with the commission to make this happen – the groups have been attempting to collaborate with the commission on the best draft language and are eager to continue working with the commission. He also encouraged the commission to consider other efforts such as participatory budgeting and environmental rights.

Debbie Kaye – stated she is the President of the League of Women Voters. The League have long supported campaign finance reform, including the small donor election program. She stated this program makes candidates accountable to all Portlanders and the critical aspect of the program is the leadership of the Portland Elections Commission. As the small donor program is currently located within an elected official's office, who is also eligible to use the small donor program, there is potential conflict of interest. She encouraged the commission to continue to work toward finding a home for the small donor election program outside of a commissioner's office. Specifically, they support a charter amendment clarifying that the public financing of elections system is an ongoing effort which will be managed independently by the Portland Elections Commission. And that the Portland Elections Commission should further be in charge of all campaign finance laws and the city's ethics regulations related to campaigns.

Terry Harris – state he is concerned that time is running out to get meaningful public engagement on any climate and environmental justice proposed language. Stated he doesn't know how the commission can get through the process of drafting language with necessary input in the next two weeks. He believes there are the same timeline concerns with a participatory budgeting recommendation. He asked the commission to consider what a charter amendment might look like to be able to prevent today's Council decision regarding the Zenith terminal.

Bonnie McKinlay – stated that she is tired of the impacts of climate change – hot summers, deadly floods, droughts, diminishing forests, etc. Portland must be a leader in combatting these impacts and work for a binding, enforceable fossil fuels phase out in the charter. Stated that she would like the commission to ask that city operations respond directly to the climate crisis.

Diane Meisenhelther – provided information on her background. Stated that the city makes resolutions on climate but do not follow through with needed actions, with the exception of the clean energy fund. Stated that the city often stops work on climate action based on push back from the business community. Encouraged the commission to include in the charter binding, enforceable actions, such as a fossil fuels phase out. Without taking strong action we will not be able to stop the irreversible effects of climate change which will have devastating impacts on life on this planet. A commitment to a phase out of fossil fuels is imperative in preventing these impacts. She specifically supports the language being proposed by the Sunrise Movement.

Kevin Machiz – urged commission to act on the Portland Fire & Police Disability Program pension funding. He outlined the concerns raised by the City Auditor and the city's financial auditor, Moss Adams, LLP. He provided quotes from a Street Roots article in 2012 regarding

cuts to the Portland Children's Levy funding, stating that the lack of long-term funding for the program could cause future cuts in programs focusing on BIPOC communities.

Jenny O'Connor – state she is a member of Cedar Action and a 350 PDX volunteer. Here to support the proposed fossil fuels phase out. She stated that what we need now is hope in order to combat the doom and gloom which has caused many people to ignore these issues. A phase out would provide that hope. She provided information about the City Council meeting when the city's Climate Action Plan was approved and how the actions cannot be fully undertaken without a fossil fuels phase out plan.

Climate & Environmental Justice Subcommittee
Commissioner Streeter provided an overview of the recent subcommittee meetings and the recent listening sessions. Input given at the listening sessions included:

- Bold climate action is needed
- The impacts of climate change are already felt by Portlanders
- Direct relation between climate and housing
- Vulnerable populations should be given priority
- Climate-related Charter amendments need to have clear, binding requirements

<u>Climate Declaration Parameters</u>
Commissioner Streeter outlined specific ideas provided by listening session participants. She stated the sub-committee is requesting that the full commission direct the City Attorney's office to draft language for a Climate Declaration. The subcommittee provided a set of parameters for the drafting of the declaration. These parameters include:

1. Clear, binding requirements that promote accountability and set expectations about how the city evaluates and makes decisions related to climate and carbon emissions
2. Enable the city to adapt as science, technology, and public understanding of the climate crisis changes
3. Inclusive of both climate (impacts of emissions) and the environment (clean air and water)
4. Lead with justice and be explicit about a just transition
5. Support community resiliency
6. Applicable citywide and no new bureaus, offices or positions created in charter
7. Definitions section

Group discussed additional parameters they may want to consider, including a possible fossil fuels phase out which does not have a deadline. Commissioners raised concerns about whether approving the proposed parameters is the commission committing to a fossil fuels phase out. Some commissioners raised concerns with requesting that a city attorney draft what is essentially a policy recommendation.

Commissioners raised concerns that the parameters are not clear enough to provide guidance for drafting language. City Attorney Haium requested more clearly defined parameters.

Commissioner Speer raised concerns about the ability to agree to a good Charter amendment given the limited timeline, commissioner bandwidth, and that many of the parameters listed may be more appropriate for city code rather than charter. Co-Chair Porta stated part of the problem is that policy progress is not currently occurring within the city, so community is coming to the Charter Commission so the Charter can require that progress. This doesn't mean the commission needs to create policy but does mean community needs clarity on charter roles and limitations in advancing policy matters.

Group could not come to an agreement on the parameters as proposed. Diana N. will work with the tri-chairs to create more specific parameters for review at the next commission meeting.

<u>Participatory Budgeting</u>
Commissioner Streeter outlined the parameters the sub-committee would like the Commission to consider for drafting participatory budgeting charter language, including:

1. Binding community-driven decision-making process
2. From the beginning of the budget cycle through the final decisions for dedicated funding
3. Open to all Portland residents
4. Applicable citywide
5. Require the City to identify and adequately fund a bureau or office responsible for implementation, but no new bureaus, offices or positions created in charter
6. Include a Fiscal Year start date

Group discussed how participatory budgeting was determined to be a useful tool for moving climate and environmental justice issues forward. Group discussed whether they need to be more specific in calling out a focus on climate or a particular budget section or if they should leave participatory budgeting specifics to Council.

> *Vote on if commissioners agree to request that the city attorney draft language based on the parameters as presented. 11 commissioners agreed.*

Expansion of Voting Rights
Commissioner Chimuku provided an overview of the recent subcommittee meetings, listening sessions from last year, and work done by Commissioner Rubio's office on this topic. She provided an overview of the Multnomah County measure, which is on the November 2022 ballot. The outcome of this ballot measure may affect what recommendations the subcommittee puts forward.

Group discussed if the parameters proposed were acceptable. Parameters included:

1. Language like the County ballot measure
2. Require the City to conduct periodic voter education campaigns to familiarize voters with eligibility.

Vote on if commissioners agree to request that the city attorney draft language based on the parameters as presented. 12 commissioners agreed.

Bureau and Office Proposals
Commissioner Chen outlined the proposed draft language related to Office of Community Technology sections of the Charter 10-205, 10-207, 10-208, 10-212, and 10-213. The subcommittee would like to have the full commission approve the draft language so that they can begin getting public input from the many stakeholders identified by the Office of Community Technology.

Commissioner Reddy asked whether there was any tribal consultation needed on these franchises. City Attorney Haium stated she is not aware of any need in relation to franchises.

Vote on if commissioners agree to move forward with the proposed charter language as drafted for public input. 11 commissioners approved.

Commissioner Avalos stated she is concerned with the commission not having time at this meeting to discuss the Small Donor Elections program. Commissioner Chen stated that program has been discussed at all but one of the subcommittee meetings and the subcommittee members are working on a proposal for consideration at the next full Commission meeting.

City Transition Planning
City Administrator Michael Jordan and Chief Budget Officer Jessica Kinard provided information on the work planning currently occurring so that the city is prepared to implement Charter updates, should the ballot measure pass in November.

Next Steps
Co-chair Porta provided an overview of the upcoming meeting of both the full commission.

Next commission meeting is scheduled for October 11, 2022.

Meeting adjourned, 8:44 p.m.

Minutes respectfully submitted,
Diana Shiplet, Executive Assistant to the CAO and CFO

Meeting Chat
18:20:03 From Amira Streeter (she/her) to Hosts and panelists:
I think I missed a meeting? Should I be able to vote on the minutes?
18:21:42 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Hosts and panelists:
i think we decided you can still vote
18:21:44 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Hosts and panelists:

even if you weren't there
18:21:48 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Hosts and panelists:
as long as you review
18:22:16 From Amira Streeter (she/her) to Hosts and panelists:
^ Ok good - I reviewed the minutes
18:23:15 From sofia Alvarez (Staff) to Everyone:
Order for public comment: Ben S., Debbie K., Terry H., Bonnie M., Diane M., Kevin M., Jenny O., and Stephen B
18:28:43 From Ben Stevenson (he/him) to Hosts and panelists:
Letter: https://docs.google.com/document/d/1Qzz7jSWvixMmZL5QDQ1tI2uF4ENeAA1xVfLTC637cj0/edit
18:30:16 From Brandy Steffen, Facilitator (she/her) to Everyone:
Terry Harris is next
18:30:25 From Brandy Steffen, Facilitator (she/her) to Everyone:
Then Bonnie McKinlay
18:31:33 From Julia Meier (Staff) to Everyone:
Everyone is frozen for me. Hoping it's better soon.
18:32:13 From Brandy Steffen, Facilitator (she/her) to Everyone:
After Bonnie, will be Diane Meisenhelter
18:34:28 From Brandy Steffen, Facilitator (she/her) to Everyone:
After Diane, will be Kevin Machiz
18:36:42 From Brandy Steffen, Facilitator (she/her) to Everyone:
After Kevin, will be Jenny O'Connor
18:45:49 From Comm. Salome Chimuku to Everyone:
Thank you to all the people who provided testimony.
19:03:09 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Hosts and panelists:
I guess I'm wondering if the date is important to people to move forward with the spirit of what's being asked?
19:03:24 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Hosts and panelists:
I think the subcommittee will discuss the date in future meetings was my assumption
19:04:33 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
(sorry posting again I forgot to change to everyone)
19:04:39 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
I guess I'm wondering if the date is important to people to move forward with the spirit of what's being asked? I think the subcommittee will discuss the date in future meetings was my assumption
19:05:48 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
I guess my question is, if we are asking the attorney's office to draft language, are we asking them to draft language that includes specifics around a fossil fuel phase out? If so, the requirements we want need to be enumerated.
19:06:24 From Amira Streeter (she/her) to Everyone:
^ Not sure I understand your last sentence Comm. Porta
19:06:49 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:

The attorney's office needs more guidance
19:06:58 From Amira Streeter (she/her) to Everyone:
Got it!
19:06:58 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
From us
19:07:05 From Diana Nunez (Charter Staff) to Hosts and panelists:
the three binding ideas at the last meeting were (1) fossil fuel phase-out; (2) climate test; (3) environmental rights to clean air and water
19:09:47 From Brandy Steffen, Facilitator (she/her) to Everyone:
the three binding ideas at the last meeting were (1) fossil fuel phase-out; (2) climate test; (3) environmental rights to clean air and water
19:10:13 From Amira Streeter (she/her) to Everyone:
I think he said a lot could be done
19:12:11 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
I like it, but can we hear Debbie first?
19:14:28 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
2-7 are fine, we can suss out with city attorney on 1 - that's my vote
19:15:26 From Comm. Raahi Reddy to Everyone:
yes 2-7
19:18:45 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
important to remember this is a vote to get maja to work on the language. the committees gotta work with her on it no matter what.
19:19:00 From Comm. Andrew Speer to Hosts and panelists:
I have concerns on where these changes would be reflected in language. I am concerned that there's too much here to accomplish with our limited time left in our process
19:19:44 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
i agree time is limited. which is why moving this forward to start the convo with maja is more ideal than waiting another meeting to test out the language.
19:22:15 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
This is exactly why phase 2 has been incredibly frustrating. There's no time to have these conversations. I don't get how we're supposed to move forward on this timeline. I'd love some guidance on that.
19:22:47 From Comm. Dave Galat to Everyone:
I agree, Debra
19:23:25 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
SAY IT LOUDER DEBRA
19:23:43 From Comm. Debbie Kitchin to Everyone:
+++Debra!
19:24:12 From Comm. Bryan William Lewis to Everyone:
👏 +1 Debra
19:24:18 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
yes those are all my thumbs!!!!!!
19:25:59 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
oct 18th?

19:26:08 From sofia Alvarez (Staff) to Everyone:
yes
19:26:38 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
y'all it's libra season you can't be stressing me out like this 😭😂♎
19:27:19 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Yes Libras!🙌
19:27:27 From Amira Streeter (she/her) to Everyone:
And voting rights!
19:27:53 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
Yes, I think going back to what Comm. Avalos said earlier and having Maja looking at the State's language and coming back. I trust that language would be a good place to start.
19:28:03 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
^
19:28:29 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Agreed-may not be the whole answer but helpful
19:28:30 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
i checked my calendar and we don't have another cj cmte meeting scheduled. are we gonna meet before the 18th?
19:28:39 From Comm. David Chen to Everyone:
But do we need language saying that Portland will comply with state law?
19:29:42 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
Maja needs to tell us what kinda treats she likes bc she deserves a goodie basket 🥲🙌🏾
19:31:45 From Comm. Salome Chimuku to Everyone:
^+1 comm avalos
19:31:52 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
True that!
19:33:08 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Participatory Budgeting was taken up in the Climate subcommittee
19:33:15 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
^what Debra said
19:34:05 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
Sunrise PDX, 350PDX, and all the other CBO's we heard from in the C&EJ subcommittee
19:46:17 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
I do want to recognize Dave's point as important for clarity and full inclusion
19:46:18 From Comm. Debbie Kitchin to Everyone:
Could we have a short explanation about the difference between participatory budgeting and the city's current process for getting input on budget. sent out via email before the next meeting?
19:46:37 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Comm. Kitchen+1
19:46:43 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Kitchin
19:46:53 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:

advisory board = make suggestions, PB = the people allocate the dollars
19:57:08 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Voting Rights for the language clarity win!😂🙌
19:57:27 From Comm. Dave Galat to Everyone:
Ha
19:59:02 From Comm. Salome Chimuku to Everyone:
We just copy pasted lol
19:59:29 From Comm. Andrew Speer to Hosts and panelists:
can you move forward the slides to the other two sections so that everyone can see?
20:12:43 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
I need another snack
20:15:16 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Comm. Cruz😂
20:17:04 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
???
20:18:12 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
sorry I don't have a time turner like Hermoine Granger! I'd appreciate transparency in that discussion as I'm still a commission member even if I can't make all the meetings.
20:19:19 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Regarding the most recent exchange-I don't think there are doubts about the subcommittee process here. The question was specific to how the full commission processes are impacted by NOT introducing something in tonight's meeting.
20:20:01 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
Exactly. I don't appreciate being told the only way I can learn about this is by showing up to every single meeting. That wasn't the standard we set in phase 1 and I expect the same for phase 2.
20:43:48 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
A great example of the opportunities for efficiencies, Michael.
20:44:03 From Comm. Salome Chimuku to Everyone:
Thank you Mike amd Jessica!
20:44:11 From Amira Streeter (she/her) to Everyone:
Greatly appreciate the information!
20:44:13 From Comm. Anthony Castaneda to Everyone:
Thank you, Michael and Jessica!
20:44:15 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
Thank you, Jessica & Mike - really great!