

**Charter Commission Meeting
October 11, 2022, 6:00 p.m.
Minutes**

Attendance

Commissioners					
Name	Present	Absent	Name	Present	Absent
Amira Streeeter	X		Debbie Kitchin	X	
Andrew Speer	X		Debra Porta	X	
Anthony Castaneda	X		Gloria Cruz	X	
Becca Uherbelau		X	Hanna Osman	X	
Brenda Ketah	X		Raahi Reddy	X	
Bryan Williams Lewis	X		Salome Chimuku	X	
Candace Avalos	X		Yasmin Ibarra	X	
Dave Galat	X		Vacant		
David Chen	X		Vacant		
David Knowles		X	Vacant		

Staff and Guests Present			
Diana Nunez	Brandy Steffen (JLA)	Julia Meier	Sofia Alvarez-Castro
Diana Shilet	Maia Haium	Shoshanah Oppenheim	

Welcome

Sofia welcomed the group and provided meeting logistics. The interpreters provided information on how to access interpretation.

Co-chair Ketah welcomed the group provided an overview of the agenda. She reminded group of all the ten proposals the full commission agreed to forward to the City Attorney’s office for drafting.

Verbal Public Comment

Jan Zuckerman – informed group of some of her climate background and requested that the commission include a binding fossil fuels phase out in the charter. She stated that this is required because the concerns of youth are not taken seriously, city resolutions are written but not implemented. She stated that the City often claims it is addressing the climate crisis but officials often agree more needs to be done and it can take years for even ‘low hanging fruit’ to be accomplished. She stated that a lack of budget and staff is often cited as a case for delay and we don’t have time for city commissioners to wake up to these issues nor should we depend on youth or families who are struggling to make ends meet in order to tackle the climate crisis.

Matt Stevenson – stated he is 17 and requested a binding fossil fuels phase out. If Portland did this, it would be following the example of many other cities. The City of New York implemented local law 154, which phased out all new fossil fuels construction starting in 2024. 35 California cities have policies for managing fossil fuels decline. Houston included a mandate that their city

will mitigate greenhouse gas emissions. Ithaca New York is the first to require 100% decarbonization of buildings. Nearly all of these did not start off as policy but started from community stakeholders coming together to demand action. These cities have recognized that burning fossil fuels is a climate justice issue, that these impacts disproportionately burden low-income communities and communities of color. By insuring we also have a phase out Portland would be taking a significant step in advancing environmental justice.

Luke Ramsey – stated he is 17 and that a fossil fuels phase out has widespread support in Portland and around the Oregon. Local climate advocacy groups have expressed their support as have larger state organizations such as the Oregon Environmental Council and the Sierra Club. The support extends beyond just climate advocates to include support from agencies such as Jobs with Justice, and the Jewish Federation of Greater Portland. There is clear demand from the community for strong climate reform as well as support on a national and global level. The move from fossil fuels is rapid, with the world producing solar energy at a more rapid pace than predicted. There is still work to do and a fossil fuels phase out would be an important step in the city doing its part in a globally supported movement.

Jena Cho Kain – stated she volunteers with 350PDX. Thanked the commission for their efforts in phase I, which will go far in expanding democracy for the residents of Portland. She encouraged the commission to include environmental rights of the community, specifically, a fossil fuels phase out. The best available science indicates that we would have needed to go on a steep curve of fossil fuels reduction by 2025 to alter our reliance on fossil fuels and its impacts. Encouraged the commission to work on a just transition plan from fossil fuels to renewable energy. The city's past non-binding policies have failed to address the climate crisis. She encouraged the commission to also consider also including citizens assembly on climate, participatory budgeting, equitable tree canopy and a re-greening policy.

Kristen Sartor – stated that as a mental health therapist she speaks every day with people who feel the toll of the climate catastrophe on their well-being. She stated that if we don't make meaningful changes now, that go beyond language and tiny actions, there will not be a livable planet for today's youth or their children. For over 50 years we've known that fossil fuels are the root cause of climate change, and she doesn't understand why we continue to allow corporate greed and bureaucracy to prevent us from preventing the destruction of earth. She stated we need bold leaders to take meaningful action now, including a fossil fuels phase out which is simple, binding, and open ended enough to ensure that it can be adapted to science to meet the needs of community. We cannot wait another 10 years and we cannot depend on City Council.

Virginia Wiltshire-Gordon – state she is here to support a fossil fuels phase out. She stated that this commitment to phase out fossil fuels would be a first step in a just transition to a more sustainable future for Portland. Including a phase out requirement in the Charter does not require the Commission to figure out the details of implementation or policy because those details need to be responsive and should be determined outside of the Charter. The phase out needs to be in the Charter where it can have an impact on all city actions and set up the next

phase of implementation. She encouraged the commission to keep the phase out clear, simple, and open-ended.

Ben Stevenson – state he is 18 years old and representing the Sunrise Movement PDX. He stated he is here to support a fossil fuels phaseout. A phase out would build off some of the previous, unsuccessful efforts of the city to phase out fossil fuels, would follow the example of other cities. He encouraged the commission to have phase out language, which is clear, simple, and open-ended. A phase out requirement in the Charter would allow for details, policy, and politics to be handled outside of this commission’s work. He stated that a renewable Portland would be more sustainable, better able to tackle the climate crisis, and more affordable for Portland residents A fossil fuels phaseout in the charter would be a first step in climate justice. He encouraged the commission to include a fossil fuels phaseout, which is clear, simple, binding, and enforceable.

Noah Foley-Beining – state he is here because the work done to phase out fossil fuels will be the most significant work any of us ever do in their lifetime. Stated he that the commission needs to hold the severity of the crisis we are dealing with at the forefront. He stated that many of his friends have already experienced the effects of climate change and encouraged the commission to include a fossil fuels phaseout in the charter.

Nikki Mandell – representing Portland Jobs with Justice. She urged the commission to include a fossil fuels phaseout directive which is binding across all city bureaus, offices, and budgets. She stated that the resolutions and declarations the city has previously put in place are aspirational, vague, and not binding. She stated that in her role with Jobs with Justice she recently participated in a committee which consulted with OSHA regarding their recent heat and smoke rules and witnessed firsthand what occurs when climate aspirations become climate requirements. She requested that the commission not keep relying on vague or aspirational declarations but put forth a charter amendment which binds the city to phasing out fossil fuels, prohibits new fossil fuels infrastructure, and is equity aligned.

Babs Vanelli – stated that she agrees with all the statements made prior to her and that the most compelling statements have been from high school students. She stated that It’s time now to act and encouraged the commission to not get tangled up in the minutia of the wording. There are thousands of people and organizations in Portland who are supporting a fossil fuels phase out. She stated that the younger generations will be around to face the climate crisis and we need to do what we can to protect them.

Indigo Namkoong – representing 350 PDX. Stated she is excited to see the progress on a climate declaration in the charter and how seriously the commission has taken community feedback. In addition to considering participatory budgeting and enhancing the climate tool kit available to bureaus. She encouraged the commission to advance a climate declaration which includes a commitment to a fossil fuels phaseout. She provided history of prior city actions, which were challenged by lack of cross-bureau collaboration, budget cuts, and a greater focus in the City on other issues, such as equity. She stated that If other policy actions were going to work, they

would have worked already. The parameters for a climate declaration are sound and would work to address the issues raised by climate and environmental justice advocates. She encourages the commission to include a fossil fuels phase out.

Terry Harris – stated he was here to comment on the climate declaration but as there is no language to comment on, so it's challenging to give meaningful input. He encouraged the commission to look at issues broader than just a fossil fuels phase out and climate justice. Stated that he agrees with a fossil fuels phase out, but this is an opportunity to go broader on environmental justice, which is more than just fossil fuels. We need eliminate the injustice of the pollution burden and the lack of environmental benefits to the community. He stated that in addition to a phase out, we need policies, procedures, and structure to support environmental justice. If the city isn't going to defend themselves against environmental injustice, then at least community members can.

Emily Harris – representing Open Oregon. She encouraged the commission to take a simple but crucial step of ensuring the city is serving the community with transparency and accountability. She stated she is here with a coalition who asking the commission to adopt transparency goals in the charter. The proposal has two elements 1) add language to the charter which clearly recognizes transparency as a city value, and 2) create a transparency advocate position, who would be an impartial advocate for promoting high standards in efficiency, accountability, and transparency in city services. This would be a low investment with a very high return on investment in accountability and transparency. She stated that this charter addition would put Portland in line with other cities such as Atlanta, San Francisco, Ontario Canada.

Kevin Machiz – stated he is here to encourage commission to alter the funding of the FPDR pension fund. Encouraged the commission to require a comprehensive actuarial funding policy and limit colas until the pension is fully funded. Nearly all other funds had to make the transition from pay-as-you-go to a comprehensive actuarial policy. This policy would result in a cost savings. He provided an example as how this could occur. He stated colas should be tied to funding policy and before they are given, we should ask what benefit increases we can afford. Doing this would also align everyone to want to reach full funding of the pension.

Independent Portland Elections Commission

Diana N. provided an overview of the decisions made at last night's Bureau and Offices Proposals Subcommittee meeting. The subcommittee agreed to proposing the elections commission independence as well as the scope of work but was unable to come to agreement on appointment process or terms. They also most agreed on a list of exclusions for commission members.

Group discussed the exclusions list. Concerns were raised with including lobbyist in the list as this could eliminate anyone who advocates for a community-based organization. Concerns also raised around including restrictions on those compensated by an elected official or campaign committee in the last three years as it may cause unintended issues with, for example, union workers getting paid to work on a political action committee for a ballot initiative or candidate.

Comm. Avalos stated restrictions should not be included in the Charter but should be handled by City Code. Some of the group raised concerns that if it's only in code city council would have a role in setting that policy, which may cause real or perceived conflicts of interest. Others stated that City Council involvement is inevitable, regardless of if it's in charter or code..

Concerns raised about the appointment process starting with the Mayor and would prefer it not be their role, in order to maintain the commission's independence. Some suggested the elections commission should have a role in the nomination process. Concerns were raised that if they are involved there is a possibility the process would become too insular and the nominations would be anti-diversity.

Comm. Streeter suggested nomination by the elections commission, with confirmation by the City Council. Comm. Galat suggested that the elections commission only set the standards for appointment but that the Mayor do the nominating as that is the only position elected city-wide.

Group took the following straw polls on the discussion elements:

Support for IEC having a role in appointment process – 10 commissioners

Support for IEC not having a role in the appointment process – 2 commissioners

Support for exclusions in the charter – 3 commissioners

Support for exclusion in the code – 10 commissioners

Group discussed potential term limits of the elections commission. The generally agreed that terms of four years cover at least one, possibly two, election cycles. Group discussed whether it was appropriate to have terms identified in charter or code.

Should term limits be established by charter? 1 commissioner

Should term limits be established by code? 11 commissioners

All those in favor of sending to city attorney for drafting language regarding the independence of the elections commission, scope of work as proposed by subcommittee, appointment process of IEC recommend, elected officials confirm, with term limits and any exclusion in code only. 12 commissioners approved. Item moved to attorney for drafting.

Climate and Environment

Diana N. outlined proposed language drafted by the city attorney with assistance from the subcommittee tri-chairs, 350 PDX, and Sunrise Movement. This includes creating a new article in Chapter 2.

Group discussed the language as drafted, in particular “... develop a method based on the best...” and suggested moving to “... develop an evaluation method based on the best ...”. City Attorney Haium suggested changing to “develop a method to assess the climate impact of projects and policies based on the best available science and environmental justice”. Group generally agreed this could be an acceptable edit. City Attorney Haium agreed to work on clearer language.

Comm. Lewis provided an overview of the subcommittee’s discussion with staff from the Bureau of Planning and Sustainability. In general, they agreed that a fossil fuels phase out in the charter would help move their work forward.

Comm. Streeter outlined the proposal to meet the community’s desire to have public engagement be front and center in the charter. The idea was to increase public engagement without raising conflicts with state or federal requirements. Group discussed whether this should live only in the climate and environmental justice sections of the charter or if it should be citywide. Concerns were raised that there are already lots of laws around public records, so may not be necessary to add to the charter. Others felt that many of the current laws aren’t working for much of the community and adding it to the Charter may help community.

Straw poll on desire to have public engagement as a citywide value, with city attorney drafting language (not specific to the climate-related charter section). 12 Commissioners agreed

Recommendation to move language provided as a proposed Article 11 Environment to the city attorney for drafting. 14 commissioners approved. Proposal moved to city attorney for drafting.

Review of Redline Drafting

Right to vote in city elections

City Attorney Haium stated she used the County language to help in the case of any lawsuits. Group had no questions or concerns with the language as presented.

Participatory Budgeting

City Attorney Haium outlined the language as drafted. She stated she included the funding floor of 0.5% of the City’s general fund, which in the last budget cycle was approximately \$4.5 - 5 million.

Group discussed if including “funding allocation decisions must be binding” could mean the funding allocation would be in conflict with the other climate-related code sections. City Attorney Haium stated that all code and other laws would still apply to any funding allocation.

Group discussed how participatory budgeting may affect or tie into the city's current budget process and what impacts may occur with its implementation. Concerns raised that participatory budgeting, as proposed, does not have a direct link to Climate goals.

Group generally wanted to keep the language general so that the community can have its own self-determination on solutions to their needs. Commissioners generally agreed that including a floor on funding means that funding is not performative. Co-chair Porta stated that combining a new form of government as proposed in phase I with participatory budgeting is about creating a wholistic, democratic process to meet the needs of the city.

Is the language as presented acceptable to move forward to city attorney for drafting, with additional future discussion of the allocation percentage. 11 commissioners agreed.

Group discussed the percentage of allocation. Many in the group agreed that a rational for why a certain percent may help meet community needs. Comm. Streeter proposed forwarding the language as is for community input. City Attorney Haium suggested having input on the impacts of any of the amounts discussed by the city's budget office.

Next Steps

Diana N. provided an overview of the current timeline.

Meeting adjourned, 9:05 p.m.

Minutes respectfully submitted,
Diana Shiplet, Executive Assistant to the CAO and CFO

Meeting Chat

18:15:20 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:

Jan Zuckerman
Matt Stevenson
Luke Ramsey
Jena Cho Kain
kristen sartor
Virginia Wiltshire-Gordon
Ben Stevenson
Noah Foley-Beining
Nikki Mandell
Babs Vanelli
Guy Berliner
Indigo Namkoong
Robin Sack
Noah Foley-Beining

Terry Harris
Emily Harris
Kevin Machiz

- 18:16:07 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Hosts and panelists:
I think only hosts and co-hosts can promote?
- 18:41:05 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:
Reminder for everyone to please speak clearly and slowly to help the translators and interpreters. Thank you!
- 19:01:28 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:
We'll return from break at 7:07 pm
- 19:06:05 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:
One more minute
- 19:07:07 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:
Welcome back everyone!
- 19:07:31 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Hosts and panelists:
yerba mate!
- 19:07:32 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
im back and no I got cheeto's girl
- 19:07:56 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Hosts and panelists:
+ cheezits
- 19:08:48 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
I need to do better at meeting snacks 😞
- 19:08:53 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
my partner made focaccia. 😋
- 19:09:15 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
wow way to stunt on us Gloria 😞
- 19:09:37 From Shoshanah Oppenheim (Staff) to Hosts and panelists:
Anthony is logging on now.
- 19:12:27 From Comm. Salome Chimuku to Everyone:
is there language that is "what existing now" I know they have current rules they function under that wasn't in the proposal but would be more "no changes" vs "not in proposal"
- 19:13:01 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Comm. Chimuku+1
- 19:13:41 From Comm. Bryan William Lewis to Everyone:
Comm. Chimuku +1
- 19:16:59 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
+1 Comm Reddy
- 19:17:06 From Comm. Anthony Castaneda to Hosts and panelists:
I strongly agree with Comm Reddy
- 19:17:15 From Comm. Salome Chimuku to Everyone:
+1 comm reddy
- 19:17:20 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:

Apologies in advance for going off camera throughout this meeting - I'm responding to dogs

19:17:35 From Comm. Bryan William Lewis to Everyone:

+1 Comm. Reddy

19:18:51 From Comm. Anthony Castaneda to Everyone:

+1 Comm Reddy. Lobbyists come in all shapes and sizes.

19:18:57 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:

Excellent points that I didn't consider before in the Sub

19:19:27 From sofia Alvarez-Castro (Staff) to Everyone:

@comm Reddy--Would you prefer to delete lobbying or define it?

19:19:39 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:

Good question

19:19:43 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:

I'd prefer to delete #5.

19:19:47 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:

Honestly, I would like to hear all the feedback first then try to come up with solutions

19:19:59 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:

Agreed

19:20:07 From Comm. Raahi Reddy to Everyone:

agreed Amira

19:20:16 From Comm. Salome Chimuku to Everyone:

also there was a lot that has been deemed "Subcommission not in agreement" might be best to hear everything then figure out from there

19:20:16 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:

+1 after this one let's just ask all the questions first.

19:20:44 From Comm. Raahi Reddy to Everyone:

can I ask a follow up to that david

19:21:15 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:

Just because we only have 40 minutes for the rest of the meeting... lots of decisions to make and lots to discuss...

19:21:28 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:

We have about 10 minutes left for this topic

19:22:17 From Comm. Salome Chimuku to Everyone:

+1 comm avalos

19:22:49 From Yasmin Ibarra she/her to Everyone:

I like the points are you are making Candace

19:22:52 From Comm. Raahi Reddy to Everyone:

great alternative Comm. Avalos—let it be written into code. I like that.

19:23:46 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:

Question for consideration-if we intend to let these pieces get sorted out in code, what guidance/language do we need to give to Maja for drafting language?

19:23:53 From Comm. Raahi Reddy to Everyone:

I have concerns about that too Comm. Avalos

19:24:23 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:

And agreed that appointing members needs to include beyond mayor/council

19:25:58 From Comm. Salome Chimuku to Everyone:
I agree with the independence but need to go. thanks yall

19:27:43 From sofia Alvarez-Castro (Staff) to Everyone:
we have 5 minutes for this topic

19:27:52 From sofia Alvarez-Castro (Staff) to Everyone:
*left

19:28:15 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
Code means flexibility that the charter cannot offer. And the PEC would suggest the code.

19:30:52 From Comm. Anthony Castaneda to Everyone:
Agree with Comm Avalos... those with means will find ways around the exclusions to exercise powers. My interest is to attract individuals with strong values to uphold the program.

19:31:10 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
To Comm. Avalos' point - I tend to agree, it feels more democratic, more in line with the spirit of the PEC to move appointments beyond mayor/council. I vote to move to code.

19:32:11 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
Just to clarify, I was NOT saying to not have exclusions at all

19:32:50 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
Can we go to that slide please?

19:32:59 From Comm. Raahi Reddy to Everyone:
can we go to that slide please

19:33:01 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
Thank you!

19:34:00 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
My response would be that the mayor and council have their own self-perpetuating potential and reality

19:34:14 From Comm. Raahi Reddy to Everyone:
what are the alternative ideas on appointments?

19:34:21 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
+1 Debra

19:35:13 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:
Let's do 5 minutes more

19:35:27 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:
To conclude around 7:40 pm

19:35:36 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
+1 IEC involved in process, confirmation by council

19:35:57 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
That's what we do on the other CRC - we participate in the interviews and help put the candidates before council for approval.

19:36:02 From Comm. Raahi Reddy to Everyone:
+1 Comm. Avalos

19:36:31 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
I would be interested in a mix of appointments

19:37:33 From Comm. Brenda Ketah to Everyone:
+1 Comm. Cruz

19:37:41 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
Second option to propose - IEC involved, confirmed by Council

Alternatively, this could be addressed in Code

19:38:38 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
+1 Comm. Galat - not sure we want electeds who have something to gain, picking who holds them accountable

19:38:54 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Comm. Streeter+1

19:39:29 From Comm. Debbie Kitchin to Everyone:
I initially thought the IEC should nominate candidates who would be confirmed by the city council but I also like the idea that the mayor or city council could appoint some positions and the IEC could appoint some positions.

19:41:22 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:
Ok, so 5 more minutes = 7:45 pm

19:41:49 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
That was a question we had yesterday - thanks for clarifying Comm. Avalos

19:41:58 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Comm. Avalos+1

19:43:54 From Comm. Anthony Castaneda to Everyone:
Not voting twice.. challenge to this on a phone

19:44:05 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
I am not in favor of these as is

19:46:34 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Agreed

19:47:39 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
Agree - was that our formal vote now?

19:47:39 From Comm. Brenda Ketah to Everyone:
I do appreciate all of the work that the sub-commission put into pulling all this info together.

19:48:23 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
Agreed, big thanks to this sub-committee.

19:48:52 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
Are we going to discuss term limits?..

19:49:51 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
yes

19:50:15 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
they currently have a 4 yr term which is also fine to keep

19:50:22 From Comm. Anthony Castaneda to Everyone:
Yes

19:50:32 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
but it doesn't need to be in the charter, they're already doing it in code.

19:51:08 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
ok so let's discuss it.

19:51:10 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
right now

19:51:20 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Punt it where?

19:51:42 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
we should discuss it now. it should align with our other decisions. put it in code.

19:51:49 From Comm. Anthony Castaneda to Everyone:
Let's discuss.

19:53:10 From Comm. Brenda Ketah to Everyone:
Do we have any control over what ends up in code?

19:53:30 From Comm. Anthony Castaneda to Everyone:
What are there current terms? They currently have 4 year term limits, yea. There are procedures in place.

19:53:44 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
they currently have 4 year terms right now.

19:53:52 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
which is in code. we should keep it that way - aka they decide

19:53:58 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
^ Where? In their internal rules?

19:54:06 From Diana Shiplet (Staff) to Everyone:
Most other city commissions are either 3 or 4 year terms, just FYI.

19:54:09 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
they have bylaws like all the other commissions do

19:54:27 From Comm. Anthony Castaneda to Everyone:
My understanding is that it's in their bylaws

19:54:32 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
4 yrs covers 2 election cycles

19:54:42 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
I see - 4 year terms in bylaws
So solidify in code?

19:54:50 From Diana Nunez (Staff) to Everyone:
Just noting for Commissioner Chimuku that she would agree to the way it the language is proposed but without the exclusionary language on restriction of folks.

19:55:51 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
no. I don't want term limits in the charter language.

19:56:16 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
With the other details - makes sense to me

19:56:38 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
Yes

19:57:51 From Comm. Debbie Kitchin to Everyone:
voting

19:59:23 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:

That's what I was thinking

19:59:29 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
hm.

19:59:39 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
ok I guess.

20:01:05 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
cool, thanks for working through that.

20:02:14 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:
Agenda timing update: Climate 8:00-8:35

20:05:34 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
(sorry I need a quick bio break brb)!!

20:06:38 From Comm. Brenda Ketah to Everyone:
Thank you for the work you put into bringing additional details and language to the full Commission.

20:07:34 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
back

20:08:41 From Julia Meier (Staff) to Everyone:
getting unstable internet - going to also join by phone

20:10:46 From Comm. Brenda Ketah to Everyone:
Or 'an evaluation method'?

20:10:47 From sofia Alvarez-Castro (Staff) to Everyone:
change to "evaluation method"?

20:11:13 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
Assessment tool? Evaluation tool?

20:11:30 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
which section are we discussing btw?

20:11:40 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:
11-1102

20:14:38 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
and DEQ got that definition from EPA

20:15:58 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:
Time check: 20 minutes left

20:17:14 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
hm ok I feel answered thanks.

20:17:47 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
I have no objections to this

20:20:32 From Comm. Brenda Ketah to Everyone:
I feel like this is responsive to the public comment we have heard and am happy with this draft language. Nice work tri-chairs!

20:20:46 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Agreed

20:22:09 From Comm. Hanna Osman to Everyone:
I do want to say that I am so grateful to have worked on this with you Comm. Streeter and Lewis. As well to our staff and BPS for supporting us with this language. This is something

we have gotten feedback on from the start of our work, and it is so wonderful to see it come to fruition. Thank you so much.

20:22:53 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:

Looks good to me!

20:24:36 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:

These are values to me. Which is what I think we can add to the charter.

20:27:20 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:

8 minutes left

20:28:02 From Comm. Bryan William Lewis to Everyone:

This does look great. It is however missing a fossil fuel phase out which our trusted policy makers have asked us for and is a clear request of the community. As stated by BPS this ensure a sound environmental policy that holds all city operations to the cities stated goals.

20:31:09 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:

wait what's the question

20:31:25 From Comm. Brenda Ketah to Everyone:

I am fine moving it forward for language but am interested in where it will end up in the Charter.

20:32:10 From Comm. Raahi Reddy to Everyone:

agreed

20:32:12 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:

Comm. Speer=1

20:32:13 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:

+1 Comm. Speer

20:32:15 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:

+1

20:32:16 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:

yeah I agree

20:32:26 From Comm. Bryan William Lewis to Everyone:

+1

20:32:32 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:



20:32:43 From Comm. Anthony Castaneda to Everyone:

+1 The goal should be to get to clear and objective standards.

20:32:51 From Comm. Bryan William Lewis to Everyone:



20:34:15 From Comm. Brenda Ketah to Everyone:



20:34:16 From Comm. Debbie Kitchin to Everyone:

Thank you tri-chairs!!

20:34:23 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:

tri chairs ftw

20:34:33 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:

Thanks for your patience too on that!

20:34:57 From Comm. Raahi Reddy to Everyone:
Thank you TriChairs!!

20:35:13 From Comm. Bryan William Lewis to Everyone:
Thanks everybody, it was allot but we did together:)

20:36:00 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:
Agenda update: we will be finished with this topic by 8:55

20:43:52 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
there should be a percentage in the charter

20:44:47 From Comm. Brenda Ketah to Everyone:
A minimum percentage should be required for sure.

20:44:56 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Absolutely

20:45:05 From Comm. Bryan William Lewis to Everyone:
I concur a whole number, perhaps around 7%

20:45:52 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:
Time check: 10 minutes left

20:47:26 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
5% is a good # to me

20:47:50 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Less than 5% is vaguely performative

20:48:42 From Comm. Debbie Kitchin to Everyone:
Agree with Comm. Streeter - that is how it was described in our session on it - the budget amount is for programs, not for staffing or the costs to administer it. Also we were advised that most communities start with a small number and it may increase over time. I would say start with 1 %

20:48:49 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
Agreed, the allocation, IMO is separate. Also, vote for whole numbers. I would be okay with the floor starting at 1%

20:49:46 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
I'm okay with someone doing that work.

20:49:51 From Comm. Bryan William Lewis to Everyone:
+1 Comm Porta, we want to empower the community to boldly do what they feel is needed. We trying to give the people say over how their dollars are spent.

20:50:08 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:
5 minutes left

20:50:30 From Comm. Bryan William Lewis to Everyone:
+1 Comm Kitchin and Comm. Cruz

20:50:54 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
Would it be helpful to carve out environmental work? The City of Portland shall allocate a minimum of 10% of the annual General Fund budget and a minimum of 5% of annual parks and transportation-related capital expenditures through Citywide participatory budgeting ...?

20:51:06 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
if percentage is a barrier for folks, I think 1% is a good way to start it

20:51:06 From sofia Alvarez-Castro (Staff) to Everyone:

we can go until 8:58pm on this agenda item

20:51:22 From Comm. Brenda Ketah to Everyone:
There is concern that if you don't include at least a base percentage, that it could be given only a token amount, as in New York.

20:51:29 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Exactly

20:51:33 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
+1 Comm. Avalos - remember that's a floor, not a ceiling

20:51:38 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
+1 Brenda

20:51:46 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
+ 1 Comm. Ketah

20:51:51 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
+1 Comm. Ketah

20:52:17 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
No, I don't want a carve out

20:52:25 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
I think keeping in general

20:52:47 From Comm. Bryan William Lewis to Everyone:
+1 Ketah

20:53:14 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
+1 Comm. Avalos

20:53:39 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:
Updated time check: 5 minutes left

20:53:50 From Comm. Brenda Ketah to Everyone:
Yes, by watching what is passed by the PB process, elected can learn the priorities of the community.

20:54:10 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
Good point Comm. Ketah

20:54:58 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
lol...no one said that doesn't help. This is another critical tool.

20:55:09 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
This is creating multiple paths, Commission Chen.

20:55:11 From Comm. Raahi Reddy to Everyone:
makes sense Comm. Avalos and Ketah, and I do think that the City should fund paving streets in its base budget as well

20:55:51 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
+1 Comm. Porta

20:55:57 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:


20:56:44 From Comm. Raahi Reddy to Everyone:
I agree with the program, I would like more discussion on the percentage

20:59:00 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
Do it auction style Diana

20:59:04 From Comm. Debbie Kitchin to Everyone:
1%

20:59:06 From Comm. Brenda Ketah to Everyone:
No less than 1%

20:59:08 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
1%

20:59:13 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
no less than 1%

20:59:20 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
No less than 1%

20:59:58 From Brandy Steffen, JLA (she/her) to Everyone:
We're at time

21:00:36 From Yasmin Ibarra she/her to Everyone:
Agreed I don't want to making up numbers without a rationale

21:01:04 From Comm. Bryan William Lewis to Everyone:
That's a great suggestion Comm. Galat

21:01:08 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
I think 1% is a floor.

21:01:47 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Comm. Streeter+1

21:01:54 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
+1 Streeter

21:02:11 From Comm. Bryan William Lewis to Everyone:
+1 Com. Streeter

21:03:51 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
Wouldn't this be out of the Discretionary Fund? Which is 10% of the City General Budget?

21:04:30 From Comm. Raahi Reddy to Everyone:
Great. meeting everyone!! Such great work-thank you chairs and Trichairs!

21:04:30 From Comm. Debra Porta to Everyone:
Good point to remember

21:04:41 From Comm. Hanna Osman to Everyone:
Thank you all

21:05:23 From Comm. Raahi Reddy to Everyone:
and thank you staff for the facilitation!

21:05:40 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
wait WHAT

21:05:45 From Comm. Candace Avalos to Everyone:
a month off?! HALLELUJAH

21:05:46 From Comm. Amira Streeter to Everyone:
Holiday party?

21:05:48 From Comm. Gloria Cruz to Everyone:
Thanks all.